ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS COUNTY OF SCHENECTADY 1
TOWN OF DUANESBURG

A PORTION OF THE ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS MEETING
AS IT RELATES TO THE APPLICATION OF NG ADVANTAGE AND CLEAN ENERGY FOR A USE VARIANCE AT SBL #74.00-1-11.2

THE STENOGRAPHIC MINUTES of the above entitled matter by NANCY STRANG-VANDEBOGART, a Shorthand
Reporter, commencing on August 19, 2014 at 7:53 p.m. at 5853 Western Turnpike, Duanesburg, New York 12056
BOARD MEMBERS:
NELSON GAGE, CHAIRMAN JONATHAN LACK
WILLIAM WETZEL ROBERT PAT PAYST
LEROY COLBY KATHLEEN KOSINSKI
PAUL REVEAL, ALTERNATE
ALSO PRESENT:
Teressa Bakner, Esq., Counsel to the ZBA Jennifer Friello, Clerk
Dale Warner, Enforcement Officer Mary Elizabeth Slevin, Esq. Stockli Slevin & Peters, LLP
Troy Paionk, N.G. Advantage Brian Cooper, PE, M.J. Engineering
Jay Parent, N.G. Advantage
Ken Bovine, GZA Shelby Moore, N.G. Advantage Chad Smyder M.G. Engineering
Chad Snyder, M.G. Engineering
Bobby Antonovich
Charity Bender Jay Browning
Jim Cook Matt Czajkowski

1	Gary Drizos Leah Ellard	2
2	Art Fry Dorothy Gallo	
3	William Gallo	
4	Anthony Gangeme Matthew Ganster	
5	Rose Ganster Irene Hayes	
6	Richard Murray Keith Rapture	
7	Terri Rapture Stephen Tow	
8	Scott Warner	
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

CHAIRMAN GAGE: Now we're going to turn our attention to the Clean Energy application. Hopefully, we will have some visual aid and then we'll have the folks from Clean Energy give a presentation to you as to what they are going to do. We will then go through and have people comment after the fact. Maybe some of the presentation will answer those questions.

MS. SLEVIN: Good evening. My name is Mary Beth Slevin and I'm here this evening on behalf of Energy Advantage and Clean Energy. We appreciate your time and we appreciate the time from the public to talk about this project.

We had been before the Board a few times before. We've had a couple of informational meetings with some of the neighbors - the closest neighbors.

This is a compressed natural gas distribution facility on a site that is off of Route 7 on an approximately 50 acre site. What you see in front of you is a snap shot of the site plan. It does not include the entire perimeter of the site. It's just a small portion to show the portion of the site that actually would be developed.

I have with me this evening a number of folks who have worked on this project who are available to

both provide presentations to the Board and also answer questions. That includes Troy Paionk, Jay Parent from N.G. Advantage, Brian Cooper, Shelby Moore and Chad Snyder from N.G. Engineering, Tim Massey from OSPA and Ken Bovine from GZA. It's a long list, but we thought that we should have everyone here in case we need to be able to respond to questions.

Just briefly, because a lot of the information has been presented to the Board already, we don't want to go through every iteration of it.

We are here for a use variance. A use variance has four criteria that need to be satisfied in order to be able to demonstrate an entitlement to it.

Those four criteria, as we have outlined in the materials that we had submitted to the Board and have been available at the Town Hall, include looking at each and every permitted or specially permitted use under the Town's Zoning Code for this particular zone, which is residential/agricultural. We need to demonstrate that we cannot realize a reasonable rate of return, that the difficulty presented which presents the need for the variance is unique to the property, that it will not significantly affect the essential character of the

neighborhood and that the need for the variance is not self-created.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Again, as described in the materials that we submitted, this property has been owned by the current owner since 1976. It was purchased for approximately \$26,000.00 by Albert Tiseo and his sister who currently own the property. They have had no income from the property in all the years that they have owned it, except for in 1991 they did receive \$2,500.00 for the placement of the Iroquois Natural Gas easement across the property.

The property is also encumbered by a National Grid easement and American Telephone easement. With the three utilities across the property, it effects the utility of the property in a dramatic way. Iroquois Gas easement not only encumbers the property with its presence, but also with the deed restrictions that are imposed for the use of the Those deed restrictions have a dramatic property. effect on the ability to use the property for any of the listed permitted uses under the Zoning Code as we have outlined in our materials. The proximity of the gas line does create a unique opportunity for this particular project which must be located directly in proximity to the gas line in order to be able to provide the service that it is designed to do. That's really what goes to the unique character of this particular property and the particular project in that it is encumbered by the three utilities. Under the permitted uses that becomes a real deterrent, but for this particular property it ends up being an advantage.

2.1

2.4

The essential character of the community will not be adversely impacted as demonstrated by the various studies that we presented; the visual impact study, the noise study, the traffic study - all of which will be discussed further this evening.

Additionally, there had been certain measures outlined and designed within the project that provide for significant mitigation of the project from neighboring properties including berms, vegetation, preservation of existing vegetation on the property and location of the project in a manner to ensure that it has the least visibility from both neighboring properties and from the adjacent community. All of those factors were considered in the overall design of this project and that significant effort was put into play to try to ensure that the project would have diminimous impacts.

Finally, the need for the variance is not self-created. The fact that the Iroquois gas line exists on the property is really what drives the project. Iroquois Gas has the right of eminent domain, so even if there was not cooperation with Iroquois Natural Gas, they would have been able to take as easement as a matter of law. That's something that was beyond their control to determine what was going to happen to the property. Once that gas line was there, it really changes the character of the property and the utility property forever.

1.2

We also wanted to just briefly talk about some of the economic benefits of this project. The property currently generates approximately \$10,000.00 a year in property taxes. At the most conservative, this project was assessed for approximately \$500,000.00. It would generate over \$11,000.00 in taxes, which is a ten-fold increase. We think that the tax benefits will be significantly above that, but that's just a conservative number to look at.

There will be a number of jobs that will be created with the project. There will be between five and 10 new jobs on the site. The trucking company that will provide the distribution will be

hiring local drivers, which will include another 12 to 20 employees who will be locally employed. Of course there are the construction jobs which will be generated from the construction of the project. All of those relate to increased payrolls within Duanesburg itself, within Schenectady County, increased sales tax revenues and ultimately increased property taxes with diminimous impacts on services within the Town and within Schenectady County.

2.1

2.4

With that, I'd like to turn it over to Troy so that he can discuss a little more about Clean Energy and also about the project.

CHAIRMAN GAGE: I'd like to ask that for the sake of everybody that's here, it's clearly stated what the function or the intent of this project is and what is actually going to be going on.

MR. PAIONK: Sure. We're going to be going through all of that.

Good evening. My name is Troy Paionk with Clean Energy. I'm just going to go through a little bit about Clean Energy and then I'm going to turn it over to Brian with M.J. and he'll go through the site layout. Then myself and Jay will go through the functionality of the equipment. Jay will get

into the transporting of the fuel. Hopefully, that will answer all of your questions.

1.2

2.1

2.4

CHAIRMAN GAGE: I guess what we are doing is we're tapping off of the existing gas line and we're going to compress the gas, and then load the vehicles that will be distributed throughout the area.

MR. PAIONK: In a nutshell, yes. We'll go through that, too.

CHAIRMAN GAGE: I know that you have presented that to us here, but I just want to make sure that everybody else understands.

MR. PAIONK: It's a private facility for Energy Advantage, as previously discussed.

Clean Energy, was founded in 2001 and we have approximately 1,000 employees throughout the United States and Canada. We're currently operating in excess of 500 natural gas fueling stations via a combination of compressed natural gases and liquefied natural gas. Clean Energy's main business is designing, constructing, owning, operating and maintaining natural gas fueling facilities. That's what we are in the process of doing right now. Again, we are at the design stage and hopefully progressing to the next stages.

I don't want to take up too much time on the

Clean Energy side, so I'll turn it over to Brian just to go into the site layout and we'll get into the actual facility itself.

2.0

2.4

MR. COOPER: Hi, I'm Brian from M.J. Engineering.

The site enters Route 7 at this location

(Indicating) and then we have a 30-foot driveway,

two 15 feet each travel lanes from the connection to

the compound area. There are landscaped berms along

the side on both sides as well as this direction

(Indicating), as well at this direction and all the

way around this portion.

Inside the area, the trucks will come in.

There is a security fence located all around the compound. Trucks would come in, pull into their station and be filled up here (Indicating). Troy will go into that further. This right here is parking for the office that's located right here (Indicating). We have a potential well location at this point that we are looking at to service the building. This is trailer, temporary parking, I'll call it.

The compound area itself which houses the compressors - this location is the gas meter and this is the access to that gas meter for maintenance purposes (Indicating).

Through the site we have a number of stormwater treatment areas to collect the stormwater and treat that before entering back into the environment.

Those are our collection of level spreaders that are located here, here a few back here (Indicating).

This is the main treatment area which is a pond that is going to treat the quantity of the stormwater of the site.

2.4

This is the location of the preferred septic system that we are proposing for this area (Indicating).

On these berms there is a number of landscaping elements and Shelby will talk to that in a little bit. Those are intended for a visual buffer and noise buffer from the public. Those would be described in greater detail when Shelby does her talk about the noise assessment.

MR. PAIONK: Just to pick up where Brian left off, these are the actual fueling dispensers themselves.

There are eight trailer dispensers and then in this area (Indicating) there is actually a transit dispenser.

Those are for the M.G. vehicles themselves. There is just one separate dispenser on this far end.

This up here is the equipment compound (Indicating) and was mentioned earlier. We connect

to the existing pipeline. The gas is then routed through the meter and then it enters into the equipment compound area. At that point, the gas is run through a dryer and that dryer essentially acts as a filter and it takes out a debris and vapor that might be present within the gas. At that point from the dryer, the gas is routed through the compressor The gas is compressed to approximately 4,600 psi. At that point, the gas from the compressors is routed to priority panel and that is kind of again what I would call the brains of the operations telling the gas where to go, based on customer needs and demands at that point in time. The priority panel would direct the gas to the storage vessels at which point we have that in that area there (Indicating). We are proposing six storage vessels. Those storage vessels hold the equivalent - each one is about a 90 gasoline gallon equivalent. So, there would be a total of 540 gasoline gallon equivalents within those storage vessels. Again, the gas is either routed to the vessels or it's routed directly to the dispensers. Again, that's totally based on customer demand and somebody waiting to fill. might be someone filling that is already taking place.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Again, Brian had mentioned a couple of these security measures based off of our last visit with the Town. One is that we have added a fence around the entire area. Normally the fencing is only around the equipment compound for security reasons. I have also mentioned that there are emergency shut down devices throughout the facility. They are within the equipment compound. They are in the dispensing area. And based on our last meeting with the Town, we have added another one near the trailer where we plan on having staff members in there at all times. So, there is an emergency shut-down being planned in this area as well.

2.1

CHAIRMAN GAGE: That basically shuts down the power to everything.

MR. PAIONK: What the emergency shut-down does is it is an electrical and mechanical shut-down. It shuts down the gas supply to the facility. There is actually a valve located just downstream of the meter which you will see is farther away from the equipment compound and the dispensing. That valve is shut down once the emergency shut down is pressed. That valve is activated and shuts down all the gas supply.

There is also a complete electrical shut-down to the dispensers and to the compressors.

by a technician. It cannot be started back up by somebody 500 miles away. You must be on-site, figure out the problem and then start it up and make sure that everything is running as it should be.

2.4

CHAIRMAN GAGE: The intent is to have somebody there, 24/7?

MR. PAIONK: Yes. And it's monitored 24/7, as well.

There are on-site portable fire extinguishers. There are the required warning signs throughout the site. Those are all required by code. All the operators are trained. Everybody on this site must have the appropriate training.

Following the commissioning of the site, Clean Energy will hold a training session, again, with operators, the fire department, any first responders to go over fire risk areas, fire safety measures and demonstrate the operations of those measures.

We've also submitted to you an emergency response plan. We've also prepared and we can submit to you whenever you would like a code compliance document that goes through NFPA52 and it runs through every requirement and talks about the compliance and how this facility does comply with that. So, we do have those and would be happy to

submit them.

2.1

At this time, I'm going to turn it over again with Clean Energy and we've got a work cited about this project because we are partnering with NG Advantage on this. Clean Energy is the fuel provider and N.G. Advantage is the fuel transporter. As far as that goes with the actual filling of the trailers and the distribution of it, I'll turn it over to Jay Parent right now with N.G. Advantage to talk about their operations.

MR. PARENT: Good evening. I'm Jay Parent and I'm the Safety Officer for N.G. Advantage.

N.G. Advantage came to fruition in March of 2012 and we made our first delivery in March of 2013 to Soundview Paper in Putney Vermont. What we do is compress natural gas into the rear of tractor trailers. Each trailer has four cylinders. They are eight by eight by forty. They are composite cylinders and it's basically a pipeline on wheels. That's the concept of our company. What we do is deliver that gas to hospitals, asphalt plants and some other manufacturing companies that are not on the pipeline. Presently, most companies are seeing 30 to 40 percent savings from fuel oil. They do have redundancy to be able to switch back to fuel

oil if there is an issue with their burners or an issue with us getting a trailer to them on time.

So, they do have a duel fuel ability.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

2.4

25

We're operating a compression site in Milton, Vermont. We're operating a facility in Pembrook, New Hampshire right now with Clean Energy. As Troy said earlier, they deal with the majority of the NFPA requirements at their compression sites. deal with those requirements as well at our customer sites. The DOT requirements that the manufacturer of the trailers which is Hexagon Lincoln -- they are out of Lincoln, Nebraska and they manufacture the trailers there. They deal with all the DOT requirements and then pass them down to us as the transporter. J.P. Noonan does all of our transportation for us. They are widely known throughout New England. I believe that west of the Mississippi they are the largest fuel transporter in that aspect.

Presently, our dispatchers - and we have two dispatchers on staff at all times that are monitoring customer data and that are monitoring our fill station in Milton and fill station in Pembrook, New Hampshire. They operate 24 hours a day. So, from 6:00 in the morning until 6:00 at night we have

two people on staff that fill trailers and monitor the data and then from 6:00 at night until 6:00 in the morning we have another set of staff that come in and do the same exact thing. We do have a redundancy in that situation and all the remote monitoring.

2.1

2.4

As I said earlier, we are feeding asphalt plants that are on the pipeline. We are feeding manufacturing plants, paper plants and hospitals.

That's part of our 16 customers right now that we're serving in Vermont, New Hampshire and Massachusetts.

I'll turn it back over to Troy.

MR. PAIONK: At this time we have submitted a number of reports and a lot of documents and information to you. We're going to take Shelby Moore, also with M.J. Engineering just to go over each one of those report individually talking about the methodology and the findings and the conclusions within each one of those reports. Then, following that, we'll be open to questions.

MS. MOORE: Good evening. My name is Shelby Moore with M.J.

In May of this year, we completed a noise survey in accordance with the DEC's program policy for assessing and mitigating noise impacts. We

assumed that every piece of equipment that is shown in the compound would be running. That would be six compressors, a dryer and two chillers along with two vehicles on-site which was an overestimation of what they would expect to see. With that analysis we did an analysis of the equipment of what it's manufactured to run at. We did the analysis and they would run at 85 dB which would be all of the equipment combined at a distance of 50 feet. extrapolated that out to five different points along the property; the northern boundary, east, west, three boundaries along the southern and two on the property boundaries and then one at the entrance roadway. All levels came back at below 65 which is the recommendation by the DEC and it is less than 70 dB which is the performance standard for the Town Department.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

FROM THE FLOOR: Miss, did you figure in the CHAIRMAN GAGE: Hold on a second. Let her finish
and then we'll go through and let her address questions.

MS. MOORE: Basically, it met the standards that were required. To help mitigate, we suggested a condition of approval where all the facilities and where the facility is constructed -- all the vegetation to the east, west and north would be maintained. So,

basically, everything along here, over and down would all get maintained as a condition of approval meaning that vegetation would never be disturbed or removed.

2.1

2.4

Additionally, when Brian talked about the landscaping, we see all the different berms that are installed. There are berms here that will have evergreens. There is also berming all the way up through here and here that will add to the mitigation for the noise and it will also help with the visual, which I'll talk about next.

The same thing goes for the visual. The visual was conducted in compliance with the DEC's program policy for assessing and mitigating visual impacts.

We also completed the visual EAF which is part of the SEQRA process for DEC.

We did a view shed, a line of sight and also a balloon assessment. That's where we fly weather balloons at the estimated height of the future highest structure on the site and we take pictures at multiple locations, so that you can visually see what you would see if you were there. This is the height that this will be and we did some calculations and some mock-ups of basically what the facility would look like from those different locations.

At the same time, like I said, we'll add the berms with the vegetation that will also help with the screening. The majority of the neighbors will not visually be able to see based on the viewshed. Most of the neighbors to the northwest, the north and the west will have no impact. The majority of the impact would be here, but we have mitigated that with all of the berms and vegetation.

2.4

That's pretty much it. In addition to the visual, we did do a photometrics plan. I know that we will have lighting. Those little dots are the proposed lights and there is also going to be lights under the canopy, although they will downward projections with shielding. They're not going to be flood lights or anything that you would see projecting outward. Everything will be a downward cast. There was also a photometric plan done to show the casting was not leaving the property.

The traffic will be completed by Chad Snyder.

MR. SNYDER: Good evening. My name is Chad Snyder.

I conducted the traffic impact study and the sight distance analysis that was performed for the proposed site.

For the traffic impact study we counted seven intersections from 30A where it branches off and

goes north to Route 7 to the west of Exit 23, over to State Route 395 over near the Town of Delanson. We counted seven intersections which also included the intersections around Exit 23. The results of our analysis show that there was minimal impact to any of those intersections based on the low number of vehicles that would be traveling through here and the frequency that they are traveling. The proposed frequency will be two trucks per hour throughout the day and there will be an addition of one to three passenger vehicles for people who are working on-site. Typically, the daily fluctuation of traffic volume is depending on the area that you live in and will fluctuate more than what this facility is adding to the adjacent roadway network.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

There were no level of service changes for any of the intersections. There was a minimal delay increase of tenths of a second - maybe two-tenths of a second according to the whole intersection.

The other thing that we looked at was the sight distance at this location. We did that according to New York State DOT standards. They point to using the American Association of State Highway and Transportation Officials Standards. Per those, we have ample sight distances in both directions at

this location. We also have all the documentation to back this up.

2.4

MR. PAIONK: That concludes the presentation. We appreciate your patience. You've heard this a number of times already. We'd just like to open it up for discussion or public questions at this time.

CHAIRMAN GAGE: A couple of things regarding the public hearing: First, we only want your comments and questions. We'll make note of them. We're not going to render a decision tonight. Again, this is just trying to get as much information as possible as we do this.

We've also given a deadline for additional comments, if you would like, for September 4th. If you haven't thought of something tonight then you could submit that and we'll try to address that as well.

If you would, when you're going to make your comment, stand, state your name and your address and then limit your comments to like three to five minutes. Hopefully it will be in the form of a question that we can answer. Whoever wants to go first, you can start by raising your hand. I'll have to choose among you.

MR. MURRAY: I'm Richard Murray and I live on Oak Hill Road.

My first question is to Ms. Bakner of the

Planning Board. Can you explain to us how the

Planning Board thought that this was a good idea in
the first place, which is why we're here.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

2.4

25

MS. BAKNER: Let me talk about the procedure. This is the Zoning Board of Appeals.

MR. MURRAY: I know what this is, but they first went before the Planning Board.

MS. BAKNER: Originally, they had gone to the Planning Board seeking a determination as to what approvals were necessary for the project. This happened - I guess it was back in the fall of last year. they came to the Town and they said this is what we would like to build here. What approvals do we need? Initially, there was some thought that it might be a project that could be approved by a special use permit, but everybody carefully looked at it and determined that a use variance is required. So, what is in front of the Zoning Board of Appeals is whether or not they meet the standards for a use variance and one of the things that the Zoning Board of Appeals looks at in making that determination is the comments and thoughts of the people who live near the site or live in the community. that's why we are here tonight to get your comments.

As Nelson indicated, there is not going to be

any decision tonight. We're just hearing people's comments.

Anybody can come to the Town and apply for anything, and the Town has to then decide how this could be processed and whether to approve it. We don't invite people to come with projects.

MR. MURRAY: I understand that.

My next question is regarding the property. She stated earlier that these people bought the property when?

MS. SLEVIN: In 1976.

2.1

2.4

MR. MURRAY: Have they ever lived there?

MS. SLEVIN: No, no one has lived there.

MR. MURRAY: Have they ever farmed it?

MS. SLEVIN: No.

MR. MURRAY: So, how can they come before the Board and say that it's a hardship when they bought the property in 1976, speculating were I88 was going and they guessed wrong? We shouldn't be paying for that now. It's just something for you to consider because that's what they did.

I own a cross-country ski place directly behind this project and people come cross-country skiing particularly for peace and quiet and the tranquility of being out in the woods. This is going to pretty

much kill that aspect of coming to Duanesburg for skiing out in the woods.

2.0

2.1

2.4

We did go to the meeting in February. The mar from Energy Advantage at that point told us that they're going to have six 400-horse power compressors. They're going to press the gas to 9,000 psi to put in these trucks. We keep getting conflicting stories.

A week ago, this gentleman told us that there were three holding tanks; tonight there is six. We don't seem to be getting the straight facts anywhere along the line here.

MS. BAKNER: Let's make sure that one person at a time is commenting. We want to make sure that the stenographer can take down your comments.

MR. MURRAY: We were also told that there was one person per shift.

CHAIRMAN GAGE: Sir?

MR. DRIZOS: My name is Gary Drizos and I live at 548 State Highway 30. I believe, if I'm not mistaken, my property either abuts this property or is in very close proximity to it - to the northwest.

I know that you're asking for questions. I guess my question is I can't believe that we're doing this.

27 1 I'd like to start with Ms. Slevin. As Mr. 2 Murray mentioned, if the owners of this property 3 purchased the land in 1976, does it go down to Route 4 7, or is it totally landlocked? 5 MS. BAKNER: It goes down to Route 7. So, the owners had an opportunity to 6 MR. DRIZOS: 7 put a driveway in and build in the 54 acres. Our property has a National Grid easement. 8 9 property has a Iroquois Gas easement and our 10 property, until we recently divested part of it, had AT&T. We found a way to build a house within our, 11 1.2 at the time, 67 acres. Now we have 37. We sold our 13 property to our neighbor. Suddenly, this property 14 at 54 acres presents a hardship because of the very 15 same easements that are on that property. 16 one, would say bunk. The easements were there when 17 they bought the property. They knew that they were 18 there and then suddenly it's a hardship. 19 Is the purchase price under this contract a 20 matter of public record? 21 MS. BAKNER: Yes. 22 What is the purchase price from the MR. DRIZOS: 23 gas companies to the applicants? 2.4 MS. BAKNER: Is your question what did they

initially purchase the property for?

25

What is the purchase price under 28 1 MR. DRIZOS: No. 2 the existing contract? I assume that Clean Energy has 3 an option to get out of the contract if it's not 4 What is the purchase price, should it be approved. 5 approved? 6 The purchase price is \$55,000.00. MS. SLEVIN: 7 And Ms. Slevin said that it's MR. DRIZOS: suggested that the property could be appraised at some 8 9 point after construction at about \$500,000.00. Our home 10 is appraised at \$350,000.00 and we pay just over 11 \$10,000.00 a year in taxes. I'd like a show of hands of 12 everyone who pays taxes in the Town of Duanesburg. (Several audience members raised their hands.) 13 14 If you add up all these taxes we're probably in 15 the \$100,000.00 to \$200,000.00 range. We want to 16 thank you all for taking those properties and 17 putting them in the toilet. 18 If you're invited to my house on State Highway 19 30 to sit on my back porch with this 85 dB at 50 20 feet -- by the way I happen to be an electrical contractor and smoke detectors are rated at 85 dB at 21 22 10 feet. Their function is to wake you up in a 23 fire. I'm wondering if the applicants would be 24 willing to post a \$10 million dollar bond to ensure 25 that everything that they said tonight comes to

pass. I'm asking for this Board to come to my house after this project is in place with its six or so 400-horse power compressors and listen to what I get to listen to every night. This Board lives throughout the Town of Duanesburg, I'm sure, whether it be Mansion Road or Carriage Hill or Skyline Drive - everywhere except near this project.

On a night like tonight, would you like to go to bed and maybe open your bedroom windows because it's going to be cool? Would you like to listen to six 400-horse power compressors about 1,200 feet away from you house allegedly at 75 dB at the property line? Would you like to do that?

We received notification of this public hearing on or about August 6th. Forgive me for taking two weeks vacation. We left on Friday night, August 8th. We had no time to prepare or go to the informational meeting on the 13th. Most of the neighbors have had almost no time to prepare their discussions. Yet, the applicants have had several months to try and convince the Town that this is such a wonderful project.

I own an electrical contracting company. I will stipulate in writing that I will hire six to 10 Duanesburg residents in my company if that's all

that this is about - in the next year.

1.2

2.1

Finally, my granddaughter came to visit us when we were in Cape Cod yesterday and I had to tell her that grampa has to rent a car and drive home to make a meeting to save his house.

If you were to sit in my back yard and listen to what we are about to listen to and watch the quote, abated light levels - no more starry skies, just light that is supposed to be cut off, but it won't be. I'm an electrician and I know about site lighting.

Listen to what is going on here, listen to the trucks coming in and out all night long, would you buy my house? It's probably worth about \$400,000.00 plus. That's what I have into it. So, what you're going to do is shift the hardship from one person to all of us. You ruined my vacation. I would appreciate it if you wouldn't ruin my life.

MR. GANSTER: I'd like to introduce myself. My name is Matthew Ganster. I'm here with my wife, Rose. We live at 13818 Duanesburg Road. I have just a quick comment and then a question. My comment is that we moved here about a year ago from Huston, Texas after we had both finished grad school. We were very excited to move here. Huston is the land of no zoning and the land

of oil and gas, as many people know. We plan to stay here forever. One of the things that really excited us and comforted us was to read over what R2 zoning in Duanesburg means. That was a great comfort. We like our neighbors.

2.1

We believe that we have a beautiful property.

Our house is on the national register of historic places. We have been putting a lot of work into it and the barn and the property itself. It's situated a little less than a mile east of this proposed site.

It sounds like this 24-hour day truck traffic is going to pass right by us, pretty much constantly. Given everything that I've been able to learn so far about the potential for noise, air, light and water pollution, I would find that devastating in fact that \$11,000.00 in tax and five to ten jobs would be enough to make this sacrifice worthwhile.

My question would be really for the Board to consider all four aspects of what granting a variance means. You need to take this seriously to really be cautious in setting a precedent for the kind of community that we are going to create. The character of the neighborhood, the self-created

problem - there have been people that have eluded to this difficulty that is unique to the property and then the zoning should all be found equally and be taken very seriously.

2.1

MS. GANSTER: My name is Rose and I had a question to follow-up to the traffic report. You mentioned two to three trucks an hour. Will that be 24 hours a day? What routes would those be on? I'm assuming that they are not all going down to I88.

FROM THE FLOOR: There is about 17,000 trucks a year.

MS. BAKNER: Excuse me, but the stenographer has a tough job and what she is trying to do is make sure that we are getting everybody's comments. If we could just have one person at a time speak, that would be great.

MR. SNYDER: The truck traffic is two trucks an hour over a 24-hour period. So, it's about 45 a day. The routes that were looked at were from I88 to the site and back. We also looked at possible future routes based on other criteria. We looked at the one over by Delanson and also the one where 38 goes north off of Route 7. We counted two intersections on the other side of 88, 30 and 30A, intersections south of 88; 30A and 7, 7 and 30A on the west and then 395 and Route 7 also. It really depends on a lot of different factors of where

they are exactly going to go, but those are the routes that we looked at.

MS. GANSTER: Thank you. That's way too many trucks.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

2.4

25

MR. GANGEME: My name is Anthony Gangeme and I live on 174 Oak Hill Road. I own a \$400,000.00 house on the I am a Northeast Haz Mat Specialist. for the freight railroad and I work for Amtrack. with Haz Mat. I know the security. I have been through many classes. I know what is coming through Duanesburg on the rails and now we're adding another aspect to our neighborhood. We are adding one more aspect to our neighborhood that is accessible to anybody. We live in a day and age of something that we don't want to think about. I can tell you what we already have going through Duanesburg that would scare everybody in here, but I'm not going to do it. We already have enough of that going through here. Now, you want to add another aspect of it. I'm not politically correct here, but I did a little research.

The traffic guy said okay, 45 trucks a day to start. Can anyone figure it out? That's approximately 17,000 more 18-wheelers that will be driving past our house on 7. How many deaths are we going to have on 7 and 30? How many accidents do we

have there? How many people have died?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I have lived here three years. I came from Marcellus, southern tier. I lived in the Marcellus Shale thing.

How many more deaths are we going to have at 7 and 30 with trucks coming up? You want that on your plate? I don't care. It's going to be on somebody's plate and that's just part of everything that you have to worry about. You all know that it's a death trap at 7 and 30. How many things happen there? I've lived there for three years and there has been four or five deaths. My children go across that intersection. Everybody says, here we go; let's add more. You're talking seven days a week, 24 hours a day for trucking coming up and down 7 and 30. Here we go. Now it's going to come up Amsterdam and we're going to come up Route 30. It's not only - let's go 88 or let's go 7. It goes everywhere. It's great that you may not have to see it and you may not have to hear it, but guess what, it sounds good on paper but why did these guys try to go to Charlton and other places and they shut it down? Guess what? Maybe it's a realistic thing. Why can't they put it in a place that's not near residential? There are pipelines all over.

where the pipeline goes? It goes underneath the railroad. It goes underneath other parts. It's all a part of something that could happen. If you guys want it on your plate, go for it.

MR. WARNER: My name is Scott Warner. I live at 777 State Highway 30, Esperance, New York.

They're filing for a special use permit?

MS. BAKNER: No, a use variance.

MR. WARNER: One of the aspects of a use variance is that they have to abide by is - is it going to affect the value of the houses surrounding this; correct?

MS. BAKNER: No.

1.2

2.1

2.4

MR. WARNER: So, they can come in and just kill the value of every house around me because who is going to want to buy a house near a pumping station?

As far as the sound study goes, I don't believe that they included the decibels levels of the 18 motors that back up which range from anywhere from 97 to 112 decibels. That's much higher than the 80 or 85 decibels that they said all the machines were going to produce.

Two trucks per hour? How are we possibly going to regulate two trucks per hour? It's not going to happen. You're going to get a truck here and a truck there. If we get snow, you're going to get 30

trucks lined up down the road. We'll be pumping 45 trucks a day right through an intersection where two school districts have a bus route.

2.4

As far as the buildings go, they are putting their balloons at the height of the building. I don't believe a darned thing that they say and I'll tell you why. The station on Westfall Road was supposed to be one building. There are now three buildings there and there's another pipeline coming through. How many more buildings are going to go there?

I don't know if there is any kind of category that this is going to fall under. To me, this is classified as heavy industrial. Heavy industrial is Article 3 Definition 3.568 "a use engaging in the basic processing and manufacturing of materials or products predominantly from extracted or raw materials or a use engaging in storage of or manufacturing processes using flammable or explosive materials, or storage or a manufacturing process that potentially involves hazardous or commonly recognized offensive conditions subject to performance standards and terms by the Planning Board in a manner that does not produce odor, smoke, noise, gas, fumes, cylinders, vibration and glare or

liquor or solid waste which is offensive in is determined by normally accepted standards."

2.4

Having said that there is a study done in 2005 where the residents of Duanesburg - 91 percent - when asked the three most important issues facing the Town over the next five to ten years, most people indicated rural preservation. When asked what types of businesses they would like to see in town, small retail received most responses followed by restaurants and professional offices. Warehouses and manufacturing received the least support. It says 95 percent of the response indicated that the Town should encourage farming as a land use.

I'm going to suggest that the person who owns this property never tried to see if a farmer was interested in farming it. I know plenty of farmers that would be happy o plant crops on there. Guess what? They could also get AG Exempt on there.

Ninety-one percent of the Township discouraged heavy industry which is what this category falls under. So, 91 percent of your Town does not want this here.

MR. ANTONOVICH: Bobby Antonovich, 465 Oak Hill Road.

Just to follow-up to clarify, I was wondering

how we are going to regulate the two trucks per hour and whether it would be written that they did not exceed that and are we going to hire a cop and pay him \$75,000.00 a year and sit there and monitor this?

CHAIRMAN GAGE: My understanding is that it has something to do with how many trucks can be filled at a time. There are conditions that could be rendered that would limit some of the activity.

MR. ANTONOVICH: You also mentioned that the gas is dried. You want to point out that the gas that goes through this 30-inch main pipe is not scented? They did say that they were going to put some methane detectors there, but there is nothing more sensitive than the human nose to that sulfur stench. The neighbors could be standing by and the kids could be playing with matches nearby and there could be a leak with a faulty methane detector that a human could pick up, but it's not scented. There is definitely an extreme danger here that I think should be noted and seriously looked at.

Also, they said that they're going to dry the gas coming out of there. When there is moisture exposed to a metal pipe -- I don't know what the pipe is actually made of. I assume that it's some sort of heavy metal. We all know that when you mix

moisture and heavy metals, you're going to leech off whatever heavy metals are in there. There are a lot of tests that the government will say that the EPA regulates.

2.1

2.4

Well, the EPA regulated the PCBs and allowed GE to put that into the Hudson. It was perfectly legal at the time, but 50 years later and through many lawyers, we have to go through lawsuits to finally remove the PCBs. So, you might pass what law is in effect at this time, but that's not saying that they're not going to be not leeching off thing and leaking into the atmosphere. I'm just talking about what is going into the atmosphere.

I'm not really going to talk about what is going to go into my well, which is actually downhill from this place. I have three wells on my property and water is pretty scarce sometimes. A lot of the neighbors around us are drinking surface water and bathing in the surface water and they don't have drilled wells all the way down. They're relying on the leech from the surface to bath in and they are chlorinating it.

I am a Senior Research Scientist in the field of analytical chemistry, so I know how difficult it is to detect traced chemicals that are highly toxic,

leeching from these pipes and from various sources. I know that people say that you have to get your I always ask what are you going to water tested. You can test for 1,000 things and you test for? still won't know what's in that water. There are trace levels and it is extremely expensive. charge sometimes \$10,000.00 to do one test. worked for 10 years in the pharmaceutical industry to make sure that drugs are safe and you can never guarantee with 100 percent certainty that there is not some trace level compound in there that is There is always a risk that you have to toxic. There is no way that they can tell us what assess. is being vented into the atmosphere, flowing down wind and that also goes for whatever they are going

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

1.2

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I just want to stress again that the pipeline is not scented at that point and that represents an extreme danger as well as the atmospheric releases that cannot be monitored. Thank you.

to push into the ground.

MR. DRIZOS: Ingalls and Associates surveyed my property, so they could tell me for sure whether or not my house falls within the plume study report. A narrow flammable vapor cloud extending approximately 985 yards along the prevailing wind direction - I'm not the

luckiest guy in the world, but if the truck explodes or 41 1 2 the gas leaks, 985 yards in a non-prevailing wind, it puts it right over my house scorching my property, my 3 4 wife and myself to death. 5 My other question is in the event of a catastrophe, which nobody seems to be talking about 6 tonight -- it's all roses. Did anybody do a study 7 to find out if a truck driver - even a local 8 9 Duanesburg truck driver fails to ground out the 10 truck when he's filling the gas, causes an explosion 11 with two other trucks sitting next to him - what is 12 the crater size and how many houses would be taken 13 out by that explosion? Can anybody tell anybody -14 even the Fire Department what that crater would be, 15 if the unthinkable happens? We happen to live within the bounds of the unthinkable. 16 17 The Fire Department isn't equipped to MR. GANGEME: 18 handle that type of incident. 19 MS. BAKNER: One at a time, please. 20 I am asking the Safety Officer MR. ANTONOVICH: 2.1 that came and gave the rosy picture of how safe this 22 Where did he go? thing was. 23 MS. BAKNER: We'll answer the questions once everyone has commented. We'll invite them to answer 24 25 your questions once you have all commented.

My name is Stephen Tow and I live at 749^{42} 1 MR. TOW: 2 Oak Hill Road in Esperance. We are about less than one-half mile from the proposed facility. 3 I do have a concern. I just found out about 4 5 I didn't see anything in my mail about it. So, my head is scrambling as far as everything that 6 could possibly be going on here. I'm very 7 concerned. I just kind of did a quick Google check 8 9 and saw their Vermont Facility where they had an 10 incident where one of their trucks about gave way. 11 I don't know too much about the details, but I know 12 that 80 residents in the area were evacuated. don't know how many people know about all this 13 14 stuff. This is the first that I'm finding out about 15 this stuff. It's in my backyard and my wife and I 16 are very concerned. 17 Can somebody answer the questions about this 18 incident?

MR. PAIONK: That was about a month into the operation, the trailers were on-site. It was February of 2013 and after filling a trailer, a system which is a portion of the fire protection system was tensioned. What happens is there was tension to about 10 pounds and it was tensioned to 9.8 when it left the facility. When the gas was loaded into it, it activated the system and

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

43 1 I'm not aware of 70 to 80 people being vented. 2 evacuated because we were in an industrial park. are no houses. There were three or four businesses that 3 were around. The fire department was there and they 4 5 actually ended up sending one of the representatives from the manufacturer and the gentleman who invented the 6 fire protection system and that was what they came up 7 with is that it was sent from the manufacturer 8 9 mistensioned. There was one home that was next to it. 10 There is a business - Triangle Metal was next to that. 11 There is nothing to the north of it. 12 MR. TOW: I'm on the downwind side of the proposed 13 site. 14 CHAIRMAN GAGE: So, when that system actuates, it 15 basically vents the contents of the truck? 16 MR. PAIONK: It vents the contents of the trailer. 17 CHAIRMAN GAGE: There are different components of 18 the trailer? Did it vent everything? 19 There were four cylinders and it MR. PAIONK: Yes. 20 vented the entire contents of the trailer. MR. TOW: How much of the stuff was vented? 2.1 22 MR. PAIONK: Eight by eight by forty; so, it's like 23 350 standard cubic feet. 24 CHAIRMAN GAGE: Is the venting of a entire trailer 25 the narrow flammable vapor cloud extending 985 yards

along the prevailing wind direction -- is that what you^{44} 1 2 are referring to? MR. BOYBEN: My name is Ken Bovine and I prepared 3 4 that report that you're talking about? 5 FROM THE FLOOR: Do you live near a pumping station Mr. Bovine? 6 MR. BOYBEN: There is one in the community next to 7 me and then there is one proposed in my hometown. 8 9 That 985 yard scenario was based on four 10 trailers releasing simultaneously. That particular 11 model was an EPA approved model. It's very, very 12 conservative. Because of its conservative nature 13 and the distance that's predicted, we used a more 14 sophisticated model to look at the site which 15 predicted a shorter distance, somewhere around 300 16 yards. 17 FROM THE FLOOR: Is it 985 or 300? 18 MR. BOYBEN: It contains both; 985 is a planning 19 distance produced by one model. The 300 is produced by 20 the more sophisticated model. 21 MS. BAKNER: I'm sorry, but as the attorney to the 22 Planning Board it's my job to make sure that when we 23 make a decision, whatever the decision is, that it's 2.4 well supported in the record. In order to do that we're 25 simply asking -- because we all live here and we all

want to hear what you have to say. We're asking that 4 you speak one at a time and we can then get all your comment for the record. Everybody wants to hear what you have to say. We're just asking that you raise your hand so that we can call on you and that we can clearly get your comments. That's all we're asking.

There is a lady in back who has been trying to comment for awhile.

MS. ELLARD: My name is Leah Ellard and I live at 9139 Duanesburg Road. My question is about the New York job economy. Are any of the companies involved - are N.G. Advantage and Clean Energy New York based? Is the company that's going to build this New York based? Is it going to create jobs in New York? You said there would be 10 to 12 jobs and 20 trucking jobs. That's nothing. New York is a huge state and our economy is failing. Why would we want to hire a company that isn't going to get our economy moving?

MR. GALLO: My name is William Gallo and I live at 488 Oak Hill Road.

Apparently, everyone has forgotten about Blenheim. That would be my first statement. I lost a few of my friends there from gas.

The other thing is that on my property that I love so dearly and worked so hard for 29 years, I'm

building a reserve for wildlife. I'm going to lose it all. The noise - I call my neighbors up on a Saturday or Sunday and ask them if I can drive my equipment because I have big equipment. I don't want the vibrations to send them to the roof of their house.

2.1

It's a shame that I'm even here. Power Pallet - do you remember that story? It's going to go the same way.

I'm going to fight this with all the lawyers that it needs to do because I love my neighbors. My community is the bigger thing. Please don't take that away. That would be enough for now.

MS. HAYES: My name is Irene Hayes. I live at 14247 Duanesburg Road. I own the farm at the top of the hill. That is 14435. My son lives there and I have three small grandchildren; a three-year old, a five-year old and a seven-year old who play outside.

One thing that I used to say is that there used to be a sign and I still think that it's there. It says "Town of Duanesburg, the last frontier." I hope it's still there. I would like to continue to see rural activity in our area. I am concerned about odors and what they are going to add to this. We live just east over the hill. I'm also concerned

about the blind hill there. People fly over that hill and if there are trucks going in and out of there, they're going to have to put on their brakes. That is a blind hill and even if they lowered the speed limit, no one is going to pay attention to it because they're used to driving fast there.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

I'm also concerned about that canopy - like what you would see in a gas station with lights, even though they are shielded. They're going to be on all night long. There will be no darkness at all.

I'm concerned about the smell, the traffic, the school busses, the intersection of 7 and 30. don't know if these trucks would be traveling -- we did go to the meeting last week at the lawyer's office. They told us that these trucks would be going 200 miles from there. It's 100 miles to Binghamton. It's another 100 miles more. roads are they going to access? Are they all going to go down Oak Hill in the wintertime or are they going to head on 7 through Quaker Street, past the school to Duanesburg and get on I99 there? they going to head over to Amsterdam? That's 200 mile radius is a big area. Living there personally, I don't want this. Thank you.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. FRY: My name is Art Fry and I live at 105

State Route 30, which happens to be right on the corner of Route 7 and 30.

I just want to reiterate on this traffic impact. I don't know when they did their study, but they're way off base when it comes to tractor trailers going through that intersection.

They come off I88, they take a right onto 7, they come east and they take a left on Route 30 to go north. They see that sign that says 12-foot 10 and say oh God, I can't make it underneath that bridge. They back right across the intersection.

I'm off Friday Saturday and Sunday. I've had garage sales every weekend for the past month. can't count on all my fingers and my toes how many trucks back across that road like that. want to add two more trucks every hour, 24-hours a day? I don't think that is anywhere near I don't know when they did their study, acceptable. but they're more than welcome to come up to my house any Friday, Saturday or Sunday and sit on the front lawn with me. I'll even cook them supper to prove That intersection can't handle that much my point. traffic. There is going to be a whole lot more

traffic deaths there than you people ever imagined.

I hope that it's not one of us, or anybody for that
matter.

The other point that I had was the home value.

I work real hard and I've lived in this area for over 30 years. I've lived in Duanesburg and I've lived in Delanson and right now I live on the corner of 7 and 30. I moved out there because of the tax base. It's so much cheaper to live in Schoharie County. I don't mean anything bad against Duanesburg; don't get me wrong. That's why I live where I live now. The only reason that I'm here is for the traffic impact and to help these people out in Duanesburg. You guys don't need this crap in this Town; no one does.

My wife and I were prepared to retire in a few years. We've lived at this intersection now for about 10 years. We developed the property pretty nice. I think that it looks pretty good and could bring a nice price. It won't be if you guys put this station up there. It won't be worth the powder to blow it to hell. That's probably what will happen to it.

MS. RAPTURE: My name is Terri Rapture and I live at 334 State Highway 30.

1

2

4

3

5

6

7

9

10

1112

13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22

2324

25

When Irene was talking abut the intersection, a lot of people are talking about the intersection, that's the exact intersection where our late bus drops off the kids coming home from school. have to walk. My granddaughters walk. They live just between my house and Irene's house. So, they have to walk home. I was very concerned when I heard about all these trucks because of my grandchildren who are going to be on that road. believe that everyone of the Board Members - that if it was your children or grandchildren walking on that road -- and it's not only 24 hours a day. 365 days a year, which is what we were told in February when only three of the people surrounding went to the meeting at the Day's Inn in Schoharie.

There was a gentleman from Advantage there and he told us that it was going to be one person working at the facility and they said that it was going to be one truck per hour, I believe, because it takes 45 minutes to do the truck. All these numbers are changing through the months that we were here. They presented this to you back in the fall. Why is it that none of us even heard anything and only a few got invited to go to that in February? Then, we get this letter from the lawyers saying

that okay, there is a meeting. It's very difficult to have your schedule free when you don't know about it and it's at 5:30 at night. How many people are still working? It's down in Guilderland and not in Duanesburg, where it would be local for people to go.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

2.4

25

In 1979 we built our house where it is and we've only been in Duanesburg for a long period of time. Why we picked that piece of property to build our house is because of what everybody is saying; we can go outside and listen to the peepers. We're not going to hear compressors which is what we are looking at hearing now. We don't have light. have dark and we can see the stars. We may not have that anymore. This is very disturbing to me. really hope that the Board takes into consideration all the people that have property around here and the way that they are feeling. I don't hear anyone in here saying that they are all for it. It's not going to bring us a lot of tax money. If it's only \$55,000.00 how come it wasn't posted? One of us and maybe me and my husband would have bought it just so that my husband can hunt there. Who knows?

MR. BROWNING: I'm Jay Browning. I'm at 535 Oak Hill Road.

I'm a FEMA First Responder. I have two major concerns. I think that they are somewhat addressed here, but I would ask that the Board consider asking for follow-up studies.

2.4

Your plume study report talks about plume and venting gas and igniting of venting gas. Your biggest threat, here and as you said earlier, is that if you have an actual compressed tanker that explodes - I understand the tankers per the Federal guidelines are supposed to be protected from certain things that are mitigated but that can happen and have happened. You can look down into the southwest and some of the gas explosions down that have leveled some communities down in the southern states. I don't want get into the details there, but we ought to ask what is the impact if we have that kind of event, not just the ignition of a plume.

The second piece is we talked about the traffic study. The traffic study focused on how long we're going to be at the lights, etcetera. I think that what you heard most of the community here talk about is the accidents that have occurred at 7 and 30. I believe that it's 7 and 30A where you access I88.

The concerns that I have is the accidents that have

occurred with construction vehicles and school We have that on a periodic basis with very busses. little construction traffic compared to what we are proposing here. So, the traffic study, I find, is a little faulty from that standpoint. We ought to look at it from a safety standpoint and understand. If we were to entertain this, what are we going to do different? Right now all that's been done to address the safety at 7 and 30A is that they created a four-way stop sign. That's not the problem. The problem is if you're coming down that hill, you lose your breaks and you get the ice, you will slide through the traffic that's stopped and thinking that you're going to stop. That's been an issue with the heavy rigs going through there and I ask that you look at those two studies and make sure that we are sound from a safety standpoint before you make your decision.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. BENDER: Hi, my name is Charity Bender. My address is 4261 State Route 7. I do not pay taxes to Duanesburg. I live in Schoharie. However, I could probably throw a softball to where this is located.

I have a couple of things to say. First, I think that it's kind of shady that this is on the very end of Schenectady County and the people who

live between this location and the I88 Exit which is apparently where all these rigs are going to be going - were not told about it and did not get any of these letters and everything else. Obviously, those people would try to come and fight for their land and for anything that they own that they had to work hard for.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

I know the value of my property once this thing goes in - I will be lucky if I get \$1,000.00 for it. I have a pond and I can't guarantee that anything is going to live in my pond after all of this happens. I have woods behind my house and I have animals that They may not be worth a million dollars, come out. but they're pretty cool to be able to watch when you have children. My children are the ones that get dropped off if they have to ride the late bus at that intersection, which is a dangerous intersection anyways, but then you have all of these rigs going up and down there and it makes it ten thousand times The intersection of 7 and 30A - eventually worse. there is going to be a rotary there. I don't know how rigs do in a rotary. I have no idea. never actually watched one go in it. I would like to know how they work around something like that.

I want to know what the blast radius is. I

want to know if that blows, is my house going too?

If it does, I will move tomorrow. I know my tax

base doesn't help you in your town. I understand

that but I shop here, so my sales tax does. I come

to the grocery store. I come to your malls. I'm

here all the time. What happened in Bernheim, I

don't want to see happen around here.

2.1

MR. COOK: I'm Jim Cook and I live at 4291 State Route 7, Schoharie.

I, too, am about a quarter of a mile from the proposed site. I agree with everything that all of my neighbors have talked about. I think that the biggest impact that will be definite will be the truck traffic that will be on that road. The intersection at 7 and 30 is a bad intersection. I wasn't here two months and there was a death at that corner. They are still going to be going down Route 7 from that site to Duanesburg or to Route 30 or down to 30A. What is that going to do to our homes with the vibrations from that amount of truck traffic constantly? What is it going to do to the

MR. CZAJKOWSKI: I'm Matt Czajkowski and I live at 14606 Duanesburg Road. This is being put up in my backyard. I bought this property to invest in a house

and live in it.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

25

Were there any studies done for wildlife? How are they going to react to the noise 24/7? There are a lot of cute bunnies running around and everything else right there. Where are they going to go?

MR. GANGEME: Anthony Gageme. I have one more question.

What tax benefit does it have for me or Duanesburg? What kind of money are we giving them in tax benefit? Also, you have people down on 7 all in Duanesburg that have to deal with it and don't know it. I live on Oak Hill. I never received a notice because 500 feet is the radius that you had to sent out, but to be conservative you did 1,000 feet. I live on the corner and I didn't get it. There was this word of mouth and this word of mouth. There are only 30 people that are here via word of What about all the other word of mouths that don't know about it? It has not been posted. first meeting was in Schoharie. This is Schenectady. This is where it is in Duanesburg. That was at the Days Inn -

MS. BAKNER: I would like to explain notice for the information meetings that the applicant held -- these

were informational meetings that the applicant held.

We asked them to meet with the fire departments and to hold informational meetings and that's what they did in advance of this public hearing. The law in the Town of Duanesburg provides for a certain amount of notice which we vastly exceeded in terms of what we gave. Also, the public notice is posted at the Town Hall and it is also put in the newspaper.

2.1

MR. GANGEME: Was it on the website? I talked to the Judge in Duanesburg - God bless her that she's on vacation, but it's not on the website.

MS. BAKNER: It was in the newspaper.

MR. GANGEME: Well, this is where it gets sketchy.

MS. BAKNER: There is nothing sketchy about it.

MS. FRIELLO: The Clerk wasn't available and nobody else has access to that site.

MS. BAKNER: The requirements of the law in terms of the notice were fulfilled.

MR. GANGEME: Okay, well if they're going to open for a vote, let's tell everybody in Duanesburg, the 91 percent, to turn this down. Let's open it up. You gave us three days to come up and try to fight. After these people came here because we had a little flyer that came from the individuals that found out about it. There is no other reason that we are here because you'd have five

to ten people here. You've been having these little meetings about it the whole time.

2.4

MS. BAKNER: Sir, all these meetings are public meetings which are noticed. There is an agenda that is provided. So, anyone who wants to participate in town government is invited to come here and see every meeting. Everything is open. Everything is transparent. All of the documents that they have submitted to the Town are available at the Town for anybody to review and anytime the Town is open, you can even request a copy and get a copy. We do everything open.

MR. GANGEME: Why was one meeting in Schoharie?

MS. BAKNER: That was a public informational meeting set up by the applicant for the purpose of informing people as to what is going on.

MR. GANGEME: In Schoharie, so we can invite Schoharie people here?

MS. BAKNER: I think that there are some Schoharie people here that are concerned.

MS. BENDER: I just have a quick question.

Schoharie County has a road preservation law. I was wondering if Duanesburg has anything like that or if they have done anything to bond in Schoharie County, which they are going to have to do if they do this, by

1 together? What's the hurry? 2 MS. BAKNER: We'll let the Board consider your request, once the public hearing is closed. 3 4 MR. DRIZOS: Why can't you consider it now? 5 like to know what the Board thinks about whether or not we can have time to organize and pose questions. 6 7 CHAIRMAN GAGE: Let's stick to the September 4th date and then we can go from there. It will depend on 8 9 how quickly we can answer some of these questions that 10 have been posed. 11 MR. DRIZOS: If the Board is predisposed to approve 12 this, will the Board require that energy post a \$10 13 million dollar bond to make sure that all the 14 representations that were made tonight come to pass and 15 are not exceeded? 16 MS. BAKNER: Just as a matter of law, it is not 17 possible to require a \$10 million dollar bond. As a 18 matter of law there is no basis in the Town of 19 Duanesburg Zoning Code to require a bond of that size. 20 MR. DRIZOS: Can this project be tabled until we 2.1 get together with our elected representative and have 22 them pass a law like that? 23 That's a question to ask the Town MS. BAKNER: 2.4 Board.

MR. DRIZOS:

No, I'm asking you whether this Board

25

1	can table it long enough for us to -
2	MS. BAKNER: No.
3	MR. DRIZOS: Why not?
4	MS. BAKNER: Because there are rules about how you
5	process applications. You have a certain amount of
6	time. They're all set forth in the Zoning Code in terms
7	of how much time between closing a public hearing and
8	needing to make a decision.
9	MR. DRIZOS: And what is that time?
10	MS. BAKNER: I believe that the time is between 30
11	to 62 days.
12	MR. DRIZOS: So, why can't you table it for 62
13	days?
14	MS. BAKNER: Let the Board consider your request.
15	We'll do that after the public hearing.
16	MR. DRIZOS: In a closed session?
17	MS. BAKNER: Everything is open. I don't know how
18	many times I have to say this. Every meeting of the
19	Zoning Board of Appeals, of the Planning Board, of the
20	Town Board is open. It is a public open meeting.
21	MR. DRIZOS: So, we can sit here and listen to the
22	Board consider whether or not -
23	MS. BAKNER: Yes, absolutely and you're invited to
24	do so.
25	MR. DRIZOS: Thank you.

MS. RAPTURE: There are two things that I want to bring up. When Irene was talking about the meeting in February, my husband did ask M.G. representatives what it would do to the value of our house. They said, oh, that's a good question. Nobody has ever asked that. I find that very difficult to believe. We have found that since February, that's very difficult to believe.

We asked when did they think that the site would be up and running and they told us fall of 2014. The fall of 2014 is upon us.

1.2

2.1

CHAIRMAN GAGE: Gentleman in the back.

MR. WARNER: I do want to thank the Board for being here. You are our voice. You're listening to our concerns. There are a couple of things that I'd like to point out.

It seems like a lot of the information coming before you is inconsistent. We're the people of this Town. I don't know who these people are. Why do I want to trust any of them? They have an ulterior motive. They want to get their business in here. They want to get their foot in the door into a place where it shouldn't be. They're going to present you with numbers, statistics, facts, just to make themselves look better than they are. Once they get in there, who is going to follow up on five

years down the road if they're off gassing their fuel or whatever they have to do -- just like on Westfall Road, they have baffles when they off-gas their fuel. When they decide that they don't want to use those things, it sounds like a jet plane taking off. Who is going to be here to regulate these guys?

2.4

We're talking about a facility then dispensing an explosive material right in our backyards. Let's not sugar-coat this. They have a lot of safety features because it's dangerous. It's freaking dangerous. Why would anybody want that in their backyard? Please listen to us. We're telling you that we don't want this here.

Another question that I have: What is the Board looking to hear? What would it take for them to hear from us that we do not accept this? Is this going to change the character of the community? Of course it is. The noise - we don't have noises like that now. At night, it's quiet. Traffic shuts right down to nothing. I can pee in my front yard and nobody would ever see me. When it's dark out, there is no glow. This is going to change the character of our community, without a doubt. Thank you, very much.

CHAIRMAN GAGE: You're welcome.

2.4

MR. MURRAY: I have a question that I asked in February and I asked it this past week. First, what are these compressors? Are they rotary piston? Are they going to sound like a railroad locomotive in the backyard? Are they going to sound like a jet engine in your back yard? I couldn't get an answer and I can't get an answer last week. Keep in mind how many communities have passed ordinances against trains running in your backyard all night long. That's what this thing is going to sound like.

MR. GANSTER: All the questions - where, in what form and to whom we address these comments by the fast approaching September 4th deadline? I just want to be clear about that.

MS. BAKNER: Address them to the Zoning Board of Appeals at the Town Hall address here and please say the address clearly for everybody.

MS. FRIELLO: That's 5853 Western Turnpike, Duanesburg, New York 12056.

MR. GANSTER: Can we drop them off?

MS. FRIELLO: Absolutely.

CHAIRMAN GAGE: The website is functioning, but we weren't able to put the public notice on it.

MS. FRIELLO: There is only one person that

66 1 operates that site and she was not available. 2 MR. MURRAY: But they could get the website and get 3 information. 4 MS. FRIELLO: Yes, email address, phone number, 5 mailing address, etcetera. MS. BAKNER: Why don't you give them an email 6 address in case they want to email? 7 MS. FRIELLO: It would be planning@duanesburg.net. 8 9 CHAIRMAN GAGE: I guess we'll close the public 10 hearing at this point. Like I said on the onset, we're not making a decision tonight. Tonight was to give us 11 12 things to think about. 13 MS. KOSINSKI: I'll make a motion that we extend 14 the public hearing to the meeting of September 16th for 15 this application, at the same time. 16 MR. LACK: Second. 17 I was thinking that you should also MS. BAKNER: 18 put in a motion that people have until September 16th to 19 submit written comments. That gives people more time. 20 (The roll was called by the Clerk. Ayes were 21 recited. The motion passed unanimously.) So, the public hearing has been 22 CHAIRMAN GAGE: 23 extended to the 16th of September. That will give you an opportunity to submit any questions you have in 2.4 25 writing.

1	here and decide that it's not big enough and then we'll 68
2	all have to get up and move?
3	MS. FRIELLO: No, then they recess until they can
4	find a greater venue and they postpone it again.
5	CHAIRMAN GAGE: Let me ask you this: Is the gas in
6	the existing pipeline scented?
7	MR. PAIONK: My understanding is that it is.
8	CHAIRMAN GAGE: That's critical because that was
9	one of the concerns that was raised.
10	MR. PAIONK: That's my understanding in
11	negotiations with Iroquois Pipeline is that it is
12	scented per standard requirements to be scented.
13	FROM THE FLOOR: Can you confirm that?
14	MR. PAIONK: Absolutely. We'll get it from the
15	pipeline company themselves and we'll have the absolute
16	answer from them.
17	MS. BAKNER: This is an opportunity for the
18	applicant to respond to questions that have already been
19	asked. If there are any issues that they do want to
20	address tonight that have been raised, we'd like to give
21	you an opportunity to do that.
22	MS. SLEVIN: Thank you. I appreciate that. There
23	is obviously been a lot of information that has been
24	presented to the Board. We're certainly going to have
25	to take the opportunity to review the questions that

have been asked and provide responses to those. We certainly will try to provide responses prior to the next Board Meeting so that both the Board and the public have an opportunity to review that.

2.4

There is one thing that I do want to specifically address. There have been several comments about inconsistency of the information. The project has been evolving. There certainly have been changes from the time that this project was initially proposed to the Town last October to now. Some of those changes include the benefit of having Clean Energy as a partner in the project. So, yes, there have been changes in some of the equipment that is going to be used. Yes, there has been changes in some of the problematic approach to the project but the project, nonetheless, remains the same.

What is before the Town now with respect to the site plan and all the other studies that have been presented within the past month are consistent with what is proposed by Clean Energy and N.G. Advantage for the project for its development, for it's proposed operational methodology and that's what we ask the Board to consider when they are reviewing. I just don't want to leave with the impression that

somehow there had been changes that were proving there was inconsistent information. It's really an evolution as a project.

CHAIRMAN GAGE: We don't expect it to evolve anymore than that it has.

MS. SLEVIN: No.

2.4

CHAIRMAN GAGE: We have that information here at the Town Hall, so anybody can come down and see Jennifer or Dale and you can see exactly what we are looking at.

MR. DRIZOS: If the project has evolved in scope, especially if it's gotten more dense, why don't you make them reapply? Why do you let it evolve?

MS. BAKNER: During the process of reviewing the project there are always project changes. Often those project changes are as a result of mitigation. For instance, the landscaping berms that they are proposing - they may be a result of change in equipment because of change in technology which happens frequently. So, there are going to be changes for a project. The thing that they are applying for is the same, which is the use variance. You don't have people reapply anytime they make a minor change to a project they're applying for. That's just not the way that it's done.

CHAIRMAN GAGE: As it stands, the project is not going to evolve any further from this point; correct?

2.1

MS. BAKNER: That's correct. What the Board has been spending time doing is asking questions, getting questions answered, getting documents submitted, evaluating noise, air, visual impacts and the Board's Engineer has been reviewing it. Ingalls works for the Board from an engineering standpoint.

MR. MURRAY: As far as the changing statistics here, they still have not addressed what the compressors are going to sound like, but the 18-wheelers -- I'm telling you the back-up beepers are above the decibel levels that they are presenting to you. So, you are not being presented with all the facts.

CHAIRMAN GAGE: What I'm going to recommend is that you put these in writing and get it to us.

Is there anything else?

MS. SLEVIN: No, we have a list of the questions. We'll provide responses to those questions rather than kind of piece-mail it. To go through my notes would probably be torturous. We'll get those responses. We will do an analysis of the economic benefit for the benefit of the Board and the benefit of the public and try to get some estimates of what the full value of the property will be so you can take a look at that. Thank you.

FROM THE FLOOR: Can the gentle lady include in the

1	CERTIFICATION	73
2		
3	I, NANCY STRANG-VANDEBOGART, Shorthand	
4	Reporter and Notary Public in and for the State of	
5	New York, hereby CERTIFY that the record taken by me	
6	at the time and place noted in the heading hereof is	
7	a true and accurate transcript of same, to the best	
8	of my ability and belief.	
9		
10	-	
11	NANCY STRANG-VANDEBOGART	
12		
13		
14	Dated August 22, 2014	
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		